

**Lesson Title:** Was Washington's Eulogy Fact or Fiction?

**Author Name:** Janet Roberts, Hug High School & Eian Gilbert, Hug High School

**Contact Information:** jroberts@washoeschools.net, egilbert@washoeschools.net

**Appropriate for Grade Level(s):** Discussion strategy: all grades, Text: 6-12 grade.

**US History Standard(s)/Applicable CCSS(s):**

[CCSS.ELA-Literacy.CCRA.R.8](#) Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, including the validity of the reasoning as well as the relevance and sufficiency of the evidence.

[CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.9-10.4](#) Present information, findings, and supporting evidence clearly, concisely, and logically such that listeners can follow the line of reasoning and the organization, development, substance, and style are appropriate to purpose, audience, and task

[CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.11-12.1](#) Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grades 11–12 topics, texts, and issues, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively

[CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.11-12.3](#) Evaluate a speaker's point of view, reasoning, and use of evidence and rhetoric, assessing the stance, premises, links among ideas, word choice, points of emphasis, and tone used.

**Shifts:**

Shift 1	Balancing Informational & Literary Text	Students read a true balance of informational and literary texts.
Shift 2	Knowledge in the Disciplines	Students build knowledge about the world (domains/ content areas) through TEXT rather than the teacher or activities
Shift 4	Text-based Answers	Students engage in rich and rigorous evidence based conversations about text.
Shift 5	Writing from Sources	Writing emphasizes use of evidence from sources to inform or make an argument.

**Engagement Strategy:** Pro/Con Documents will provide information about Washington as a: General, President and Citizen

**Discussion Strategy:** Modified Fishbowl discussion after completing the small group questions then followed by an argumentative writing piece.

**Student Readings:** the three Pro/Con Documents

**Total Time Needed:** 2 classes (non-block)

Day 1: Read Pro/Con Documents, and make notations on their papers & discuss the fishbowl process

Day 2: Fishbowl discussion and prepare for writing assessment

**Description of Lesson Assessment:** Students will read Pro/Con documents about Washington and then using the modified fishbowl technique discuss his merits as a: General, President and Citizen

**How will students reflect on the process and their learning:** a summative essay will be completed following the discussion.

## Student Handout

### Discussion Topic:

Henry "Light Horse Harry" Lee III is quoted as saying George Washington was,

*"The first in war, the first in peace and the first in hearts of his fellow citizens."*

Evaluate whether Washington merited this eulogy.

### Directions:

The following documents will present Pro and Con information about George Washington as a general, president and citizen. These documents will then be used for a whole class discussion. You will be graded upon your use of information in a summative essay as well as participation in the discussion. Please see your rubrics for scoring.

## Pro/Con #1 Washington as a General

<b>General Information about George Washington's military career.</b>	
<p>Pre-Revolution: George Washington received his first military commission from the British government. His first taste of battle was at age 22 when he met the French at Fort Mifflin. He was forced to surrender. He later was a volunteer aide de campe to General Braddock. When Braddock was mortally wounded at the Monongahela River in 1755 he took command and led the men to safety. In recognition he was given command of the entire Virginian force</p> <p>Revolution: Commissioned by Congress in 1775 to take control of the Continental Army and was Commander for 8 years. Only went home twice during this time. Resigned his commission on December 23, 1783 like the ancient Roman hero Cincinnatus. Was able to gain the help of the French through victories</p>	
Pro	Con
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-Unanimously chosen to lead the Continental Army</li> <li>-He had the most military experience of any American leader at the time, which was gained in the field and by reading books about military tactics</li> <li>-Had men vaccinated for small pox, first case of mass military vaccination in American history</li> <li>-moved the British out of Boston in 1776 after they had taken over the city</li> <li>-Excellent strategist and most knowledgeable military leader for frontier fighting and rallying troops</li> <li>-On Christmas night 1776 led a surprise attack on the British at Trenton. They were successful in their attack.</li> <li>-a few days later forged the ice choking the Delaware River again to defeat the British at Princeton.</li> <li>-accepted African Americans into the Army</li> <li>-defeated General Cornwallis' troops at the Battle of Yorktown on October 19, 1781.</li> <li>-He did not strictly fight in formations; this allowed flexibility to move soldiers and fight in various terrain; also was able to successfully keep British armies away from their bases for more supplies and reinforcements</li> <li>-Brought in Baron Friedrich von Steuben from Prussia to drill/train the armies. This allowed the army to follow directions better and quicker while under extreme duress</li> <li>-Battle of Saratoga in fall of 1777: cut off British General Burgoyne from reinforcements and captured his entire army. This victory prompted the French to enter the war in support of the Americans</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-No formal military experience; relied on the Prussian Baron Friedrich von Steuben, other appointees and French to provide training/organization to military for: cavalry, artillery and maintaining supply lines</li> <li>-Newburgh Conspiracy in March 1783 was a near revolt because of unpaid commissions amongst officers</li> <li>-winter 1777 an estimated 2000-2500 soldiers die of disease at Valley Forge, more than the number lost in any single battle of the war</li> <li>-lost New York City in 1776 and was forced to retreat and surrender Fort Mifflin and 2,800 men</li> <li>-many soldiers left the Army when their 2 year enlistments were up</li> <li>-shortage of soldiers; they were also unpaid most times</li> <li>-lacked the majority of public support for most of the war</li> <li>-lost most battles that were fought in open fields</li> <li>-Battle of Long Island was a huge loss, US was outnumbered, out maneuvered and many men deserted; led to the loss of New York City.</li> <li>-British General Howe took the American Capital of Philadelphia because they were outmaneuvered</li> <li>-more soldiers died of disease than of their wounds</li> <li>-had General Sullivan destroy 40 Iroquois Villages because of their association(?) with the British</li> <li>-most of the supporting generals had to pay for their troops supplies</li> </ul>

## Modified Fishbowl Strategy

1. Provide a common reading and background on an unresolved or controversial issue to the class. Utilize a reading strategy to help students to access the text and force them to choose quotes or facts from the text pertaining to the issue. Have students write down their interesting facts and quotes on post-it notes or small pieces of paper.
2. Make one circle in your classroom with +/- 5 chairs in each. The chairs will face inwards. Outside of each circle, make another circle of chairs. (if your class is large, multiple circles can be created)
  - a. The inner circle of chairs is the “fishbowl” and students in these chairs are very talkative, intelligent and scholarly fish.
  - b. The outer circle represents people who love to learn from their fish and provide them “fish food” if any of the fish need additional ideas
  - c. Leave one chair empty for the “Flying Fish”
  - d. Hand out Fishbowl Student Notetaker for students sitting in the outer circle to complete.
3. RULE: Only students in the fishbowl (inner circle) are allowed to speak during this activity.
  - a. Students in the fishbowl engage in deliberation of an issue presented, as an open-ended question, by the teacher.
  - b. All participants must abide by the rules of civic discussion and common courtesy and use
  - c. accountable talk.
4. The outside circle has a responsibility of providing “fishfood” (strip of paper/post-it) with relevant information that can be used by the fish if they need assistance. For this reason, it can be very positive to pair students on the inside/outside of the circle so that someone with great confidence is on the outside helping the less confident “fish” on the inside.
5. “Flying Fish” one of the chairs in the inner circle of the fishbowl is empty for a person who just has to make a statement. A student may only use this chair once and only if their statement is relevant and permitted by the teacher.
6. Once a student in the circle has spoken (how many times the student needs to speak is up to the teacher) the teacher taps a student from the outside on the shoulder and that student switches places with the student from the inner circle. The student in the circle will exit to the outside observation seats and work on their Student Notetaker. This process can continue throughout the discussion.
7. The **teacher does not** participate in the discussion except to provide a new question or to terminate an irrelevant, or inappropriate, line of discussion.
8. It is highly effective to have two separate (but related) discussion questions. After you have completed a fishbowl on one question, you can begin the next question by reversing the original groups. Fish become fish feeders and feeders become fish.
9. Including a written reflection piece is a great way to assess student learning. Students can use their Notetake as a rough guide for their reflection piece. (make sure that they include a counter claim☺)

## Discussion Rubric

Student's Name:	3	2	1	0
<b>Substantive</b>				
States and identifies issues.	Accurately states and identifies issues.	Accurately states an issue.	States a relevant factual, ethical, or definitional issue as a question.	Does not state any issues.
Uses foundational knowledge.	Accurately and expresses completely relevant foundational knowledge pertaining to the issues raised during the discussion.	Accurately expresses mostly relevant foundational knowledge pertaining to issues raised during the discussion.	Accurately expresses somewhat relevant foundational knowledge pertaining to an issue raised by someone else.	Does not express any relevant foundational knowledge.
Elaborates statements with explanations, reasons, or evidence.	Pursues an issue with more than one elaborated statements.	Pursues an issue with one elaborated statement.	Elaborates a statement with an explanation, reasons, or evidence.	Does not elaborate any issues.
<b>Procedural</b>				
Invites contributions from, and acknowledges statements of others.	Engages others in the discussion by inviting their contributions and acknowledging their contributions.	Invites comments from others and does not acknowledge their statements.	Does not invite comments from others but allows others to speak. Does not acknowledge contributions from others.	Doesn't invite comments from others nor acknowledge their statements.
Challenges the accuracy, logic, relevance, or clarity of statements.	Constructively challenges the accuracy, clarity, relevance, or logic of statements made.	Responds in a civil manner to a statement made by someone else by challenging its accuracy, clarity, relevance, or logic.	Responds in a civil manner but does not challenge the accuracy, clarity, relevance, or logic of statements.	Does not respond in a civil manner in all conversations. Does not challenge the accuracy, clarity, relevance, or logic of statements.

Notes-

# Fishbowl Discussion Note Taker:

Your Claim:

Evidence:

1:

2:

3:

Rebuttal to someone who disagrees with you: (Although..., (insert name) brings up an interesting point, but

Evidence:

Question for others you have after the discussion:

Did your opinion change: (Circle One)      Yes    or    No

Reason: (whether Yes or No)

New Ideas or concepts you hadn't thought of:



**Writing Prompt:**

Henry "Light Horse Harry" Lee III is quoted as saying George Washington was,  
"The first in war, the first in peace and the first in hearts of his fellow citizens."

Evaluate whether Washington merited this eulogy.

## Writing Prompt Outline:

Write the question:

---

---

---

Restate the question in your own words:

---

---

---

---

YOUR CLAIM: (INTRODUCTION)

---

---

---

---

EVIDENCE #1 ( \_\_\_\_\_ )

---

---

---

---

REASON #1

---

---

---

---

EVIDENCE #2 ( \_\_\_\_\_ )

---

---

---

---



REASON #2

---

---

---

---

**EVIDENCE #3 (** 

---

**)**

---

---

---

---

REASON #3

---

---

---

---

COUNTER CLAIM: (Although, In some cases..., On occasion..., Another opinion is...,)

---

---

---

---

COUNTER CLAIM REASON: (explain how the counter claim also connects to the claim)

---

---

---

---

CONCLUSION:

---

---

---

---